

Setti D. Warren Mayor

# City of Newton, Massachusetts

Department of Planning and Development 1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone (617) 796-1120 Telefax (617) 796-1142 TDD/TTY (617) 796-1089 www.newtonma.gov

Candace Havens Director

## MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS **NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

DATE: May 23, 2013

PLACE/TIME: City Hall, Room 202

6:30 p.m.

**ATTENDING: Donald Lang, Chair** 

**David Morton, Member** 

**Brian Lever, Staff** 

Nancy Grissom, Member

Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

See Attendance List

**ABSENT:** William Roesner, Member

> Rodney Barker, Member **Donald Tellalian, Alternate** Leonard Sherman, Alternate

The meeting was called to order at 6:30 p.m. with Donald Lang presiding as Chair. Voting permanent members were Lang, Grissom, Morton, and Wojciechowski. Brian Lever acted as recording secretary and the meeting was digitally recorded.

## 35 Webster Street - Landmark / Preservation Restriction Review

This item was withdrawn at the request of the applicant.

#### 25 Paul Street - Demolition Review

Property owner Eugene Borochin presented an application to demolish the residence. Staff stated that this circa 1871 Second-Empire residence is located in Newton Centre in a neighborhood of other late 19<sup>th</sup> century buildings along with two modern apartment complexes. During the 1870s, the property was owned by John Staples, a carpenter who later built a home (not extant) on an adjacent parcel. Afterward the building was occupied by the Amsden family through the early 20<sup>th</sup> century. The building has had some alterations including additions to the side and rear, replacement siding and windows, and an asphalt shingle roof; however the overall form and massing has been retained. The Commission reviewed the application as well as photographs of the property and neighborhood. Lang suggested that the building could be renovated with an addition allowing for an additional dwelling unit. Borochin stated that the existing building had been altered with siding and additions and that he wished to construct a new building. Abutter Ken Gabriel (17 Paul Street) expressed concern about the future use of the property and advocated for the demolition of the workshop at the rear of the lot. Staff stated that approval for demolition for the workshop had already been granted. Wojciechowski and Morton stated that they

supported the preservation of the building. Grissom motioned to find the residence preferably preserved with Morton seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 23, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

**RESOLVED** to find the residence at 25 Paul Street Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair Nancy Grissom, Member

David Morton, Member Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

## 97 Auburn Street - Demolition Review

Property owner Lev Romm presented an application to demolish the residence. Staff stated that this circa 1880 Victorian was originally owned by William Smith, a carpenter who owned the property into the early 20<sup>th</sup>-century, when the ownership quickly changed with various owners. It is located in a neighborhood with other 19<sup>th</sup>-century residences that have architectural styles including Greek Revival, Italianate, Queen Anne and others. The building has had its windows and window openings replaced, vinyl siding added, an asphalt shingle roof added as well as an addition added to the side and rear. The building also likely had a large front porch, which is no longer present. Form and massing suggest that the building could have been originally a Queen Anne variant. The Commission reviewed the application as well as photographs of the property and neighborhood. Romm discussed the alterations that have occurred to the building. Grissom noted that there were several 20<sup>th</sup> century buildings in the area around this property. Wojciechowski stated that while the form is present, the details are not and that he did not support the preservation of the building. Grissom motioned to find the building not preferably preserved with Morton seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 23, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 3-1,

**RESOLVED** to find the residence at 97 Auburn Street Not Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:Voting in the Negative:Nancy Grissom, MemberDonald Lang, Chair

David Morton, Member

Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

#### **Administrative Discussion**

Staff informed the Commission that the Massachusetts Historical Commission had awarded the City \$10,000 to assist with surveying and documenting 19<sup>th</sup> century buildings dating from the Early Industrial Period (1831-1870).

Staff informed the Commission that the Planning and Development Board will be having a hearing on the removal of trees along Grove Street and that under the procedures established for reviewing projects on designated Scenic Roads, the Commission was being notified of the hearing in the event that members wished to attend.

#### Minutes:

The Commission approved the April 2013 minutes unanimously with Morton and Wojciechowski abstaining.

#### 180 Pine Ridge Road – Demolition Review

This item was withdrawn at the request of the applicant.



## 95 Spiers Road - Demolition Review

Property owner Marc Sirote presented an application to demolish the residence. The Commission reviewed the application and photographs of the property and neighborhood. Staff stated that this 1948 Ranch style residence is located in Oak Hill Park, but not on the path system. The building has had few if any alterations and is an intact example of one of the original residences. The building's first occupants were Richard and Ruth Szekley. Richard worked as a dentist. The surrounding neighborhood context along Spiers Road has changed substantially with the construction of larger new residences including one adjacent to this property as well as others in the immediate vicinity. Lang noted that the building was modest, not located on the path system, and in an area with new construction. Wojciechowski stated that the streetscape has been transformed. Sirote stated that he had lived at the property since 1968 and had tried selling the property before without success. Sirote further stated that he wanted the demolition approval in order to sell the property to a developer who would construct a new residence. Jennifer Gorham (31 Kappius Path) stated that she supported the demolition of the building. Grissom motioned to find the building not preferably preserved with Wojciechowski seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 23, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

**RESOLVED** to find the residence at <u>95 Spiers Road</u> Not Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair Nancy Grissom, Member
David Morton, Member Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

#### 12 Considine Road - Demolition Review

Greg Shay presented an application to demolish the residence. Staff stated that this 1948 Ranch style residence is located in Oak Hill Park, but not on the path system. The building has vinyl siding and replacement windows, but otherwise is an intact example of one of the original residences. There is a one-story rear addition, but it is in keeping with the scale and massing of the main block. The building's first occupants were Martin and Claire Joyce. Martin worked as a clerk at the Post Office. The surrounding neighborhood context along Considine and adjacent Bontempo Roads has changed substantially with the construction of larger new residences including one adjacent to this property as well as others in the immediate vicinity. The Commission reviewed the application and photographs of the property and neighborhood. Shay presented a map showing original Oak Hill Park residences, new construction, and altered original residences. Lang stated that the Oak Hill Park buildings have value as a collection, but that in this area a substantial collection no longer exists. Wojciechowski stated that the building was an example of mid-20<sup>th</sup> century architecture. Morton stated that he believed the building did not warrant preservation. Grissom motioned to find the building not preferably preserved with Wojciechowski seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 23, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

**RESOLVED** to find the residence at <u>12 Considine Road</u> Not Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair Nancy Grissom, Member
David Morton, Member Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

25 Annawan Road – Demolition Review



Property owner Charles Nicolazzo presented an application to demolish the residence. Staff stated that this 1916 Dutch Colonial is located in a neighborhood of other early 20<sup>th</sup> century residences. The building was designed by architect Francis Bullman and owned by briefly by George and Jennie Hall. George worked as a salesman in Boston. The property changed ownership quickly and was owned by Frederic (a coffee broker) and Eleanor Lucy in 1919 and then George (an engineer) and Maude Aborn in 1934. The building retains its form and details including slate roof, wood trim, and wood windows. The surrounding neighborhood context consists of other Colonial Revival variants, Craftsman, and Tudor style residences dating from the early 20<sup>th</sup> century. The Commission reviewed the application, historical documentation on the neighborhood as well as photographs of the property and neighborhood. Lang asked if the building could be renovated and Nicolazzo responded that the building was in tough shape with water and sewer issues. Lang stated that he felt the building had maintained its historic details and was in a neighborhood of other buildings from the same time period. The Commission discussed the procedures under the Demolition Delay Ordinance including that it was a one-year delay with the option of returning to apply for a waiver of the delay. Grissom motioned to find the building preferably preserved with Wojciechowski seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 23, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

**RESOLVED** to find the residence at <u>25 Annawan Road</u> Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair Nancy Grissom, Member
David Morton, Member Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

#### 1058 Beacon Street - Demolition Review

No applicant was present for this item. Staff stated that this property consists of a circa 1868 worker cottage believed to have been moved back from Beacon Street to its current location in the 1890s as well as a circa 1890 barn. The property was owned by William Connell, an Irish laborer who resided here through the early 20<sup>th</sup>-century. The immediate vicinity consists of the Whole Foods as well as 19<sup>th</sup>-century residences along Beacon Street with some early 20<sup>th</sup>-century buildings as well off of Pine Crest Road. Of the two buildings, the residence has had more substantial alterations including vinyl siding, replacement windows, and a new porch. The residence does however retain two pedimented dormers, which suggest Greek-Revival style. The barn to the rear of the property has replacement windows, but is largely intact. The Commission reviewed the application, historical documentation on the property, a letter in support of preserving the buildings from abutter Leslie Zebrowitz (62 Pine Crest Road) as well as photographs of the property and neighborhood. Wojciechowski stated that the property fits into a broader historical context involving worker housing in the mid-19<sup>th</sup> century. Abutters Mary McCully (46 Pine Crest Road) and Ariella Stober (58 Pine Crest Road) expressed concern over what might happen to the property. Grissom stated that she felt the buildings were worth preserving and that barns were a rarity in Newton. Wojciechowski motioned to find both buildings preferably preserved due to their intact historical character and time period with Grissom seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 23, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

**RESOLVED** to find the residence and barn at <u>1058 Beacon Street</u> Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair Nancy Grissom, Member
David Morton, Member Alfred Wojciechowski, Member



## 33 Crestwood Road - Demolition Review

Architect Dean Hofelich presented an application to demolish the building. The Commission reviewed the application as well as photographs of the property and neighborhood. Staff stated that this 1957 Contemporary designed by the architecture firm of Hoover & Hill is located in a neighborhood of other mid-20<sup>th</sup> century residences such as another Contemporary residence and a Cape style residence as well as newer homes from the 1990s through 2000s. The building was originally owned by Martha and Loomis Patrick. Loomis was the President of the West Newton Cooperative Bank. The building was later owned by Seiji Ozawa, a noted Japanese conductor and music director of the Boston Symphony Orchestra. The one-story building features a brick exterior and is partially screened from view due to existing vegetation. No discernible alterations are visible on the exterior of the building. Due to the late construction dates of the homes along Crestwood Road, several buildings were demolished prior to review of the Newton Historical Commission as they were not yet 50 years old, however the Commission did review and approve demolition of 20 Crestwood Road, a 1910 Mission style residence. Unlike Ranches and Capes, Newton has far fewer Contemporary style buildings, though an exact count is unknown. Lang stated that the building fits well into its landscaped setting and is in a neighborhood with a mix of architectural styles. Morton stated that he thought the building was well designed and should be preserved. Hofelich stated that the building did not meet the needs of the new owners. Grissom motioned to find the building preferably preserved due to the occupants, its intact design, and the relationship between the building and the landscaped setting.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 23, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

**RESOLVED** to find the residence at 33 Crestwood Road Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair Nancy Grissom, Member
David Morton, Member Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

## 44 Mary Ellen Road - Demolition Review

Property owners Ryan and Kristen Lenhant presented an application to demolish the residence. The Commission reviewed the application, historical documentation on the neighborhood as well as photographs of the property and neighborhood. Staff stated that this 1951 Ranch was built by the Ashland Corporation and is one of many Ranch style residences on Mary Ellen and Evelyn Roads. The building was first owned by Ira and Ruth Haimson. Ira worked in the clothing industry. The building has vinyl siding, but appears to be in largely original condition. This neighborhood is significant as an example of post-WWII development and has a strong Ranch style architectural context. In the past the Commission has consistently found buildings in this neighborhood preferably preserved. Ryan Lenhant stated that the building had substantial water infiltration issues and issues with mold. Kristen Lenhant stated that they had examined renovation as an option and found it to be very expensive and that they were unsure if they could address all of the issues. Abutter Peter Lewenberg (47 Mary Ellen Road) stated that there are substantial water problems on the street including a high water table. Wojciechowski stated that there were two considerations: the building and the neighborhood. Lang stated that he felt the building was not an exceptional architectural example, but noted that it did fit within the neighborhood. Grissom stated that there were other architectural examples in the area including Split-Levels and new construction. Wojciechowski motioned to find the building not preferably preserved with Morton seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>May 23, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>4-0</u>,

**RESOLVED** to find the residence at <u>44 Mary Ellen Road</u> Not Preferably Preserved.



Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair David Morton, Member Nancy Grissom, Member Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

#### 151 Jackson Road - Demolition Review

No applicant was present for this item. The Commission reviewed the application as well as photographs of the property and neighborhood. Staff sated that this 1914 Craftsman style residence is located in a neighborhood largely consisting of Colonial Revival style residences. The home was originally owned by Elbert Bartlett, a clerk in Cambridge and later owned by Frederick and Mary Kehn. Frederick worked as an accountant in Boston. The exterior of the building appears to have few if any alterations with the exception of replacement windows. The surrounding neighborhood context has buildings that have had alterations including replacement siding and windows, as well as additions. While consistent in scale there is variation in style in the area with Garrison and Dutch Colonials as well as English Revival buildings. Neighbor Kim Hyland asked if the application had to be submitted by the owner as she believed the property was owned by a bank. Staff stated that if the applicant did not have legal control over the property, the actions taken by the Commission would be invalidated and the process would have to start over with a new application. Morton noted the shingle detail on the exterior and the other historic details. Lang stated that he believed this building was worth preserving. Morton motioned to find the building preferably preserved with Grissom seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 23, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

**RESOLVED** to find the residence at 151 Jackson Street Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair Nancy Grissom, Member
David Morton, Member Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

#### 1538 Beacon Street - Demolition Review

Property owners Alan and Veronica Rudikoff presented an application to demolish the residence. The Commission reviewed the application, historical documentation on the property as well as photographs of the property and neighborhood. Staff stated that this 1895 Colonial Revival is located along a stretch of Beacon Street with other late Victorian era buildings in particular Shingle style residences including those adjacent to this property. The building was initially owned by Arthur and Irene Vose. Arthur was a bookkeeper in Boston. The property then went through a quick succession of owners in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century including Carlyle Hayes who worked in insurance in Boston. The building presently has aluminum siding and has had some other minor alterations including the construction and subsequent enclosure of a sleeping porch on the rear of the building and replacement windows. Alan Rudikoff stated that they initially considered constructing an addition, but that the building has settlement issues including cracks in the foundation as well as alterations including replacement siding and windows. Lang stated that renovation could be more cost effective than constructing a new building. Morton and Wojciechowski stated that given the building's condition that it did not warrant preservation. Wojciechowski noted that the form and massing had been retained, but that there were few historic details present. Wojciechowski motioned to find the building not preferably preserved with Morton seconding, this motion failed to pass. Grissom motioned to find the building preferably preserved with Lang seconding, this motion failed to pass.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>May 23, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>2-2</u>,

**RESOLVED** to find the residence at 1538 Beacon Street Not Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Alfred Wojciechowski, Member **Donald Lang, Chair David Morton, Member** Nancy Grissom, Member

Motion fails, due to lack of a majority.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 23, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>4-0</u>,

**RESOLVED** to find the residence at 1538 Beacon Street Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: **Donald Lang, Chair David Morton, Member** 

Nancy Grissom, Member Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

Motion fails, due to lack of a majority. Building found not preferably preserved due to lack of a majority vote to initiate the Demolition Delay.

## 310 Newtonville Avenue - Demolition Review

David D' Amico presented an application to demolish the building. The Commission reviewed the application as well as photographs of the property and neighborhood. Staff stated that circa 1886 Queen Anne is located in a neighborhood with a mix of architectural styles and construction dates. The building was originally owned by William Lawrence, a clerk and then quickly sold to Charles and Clara Woodward. Charles worked at H. R. Boots and Shoes in Boston. The property was later owned by William Hinman. The building has had asbestos siding added to the exterior and some of the windows have been replaced. On the rear a two-story porch has been added, but overall the form remains intact. The surrounding neighborhood context is a mix of a few Victorian residences and largely 20<sup>th</sup> century residences including multi-families and condominium complexes. A more substantial concentration of Victorian buildings is seen east along Newtonville Avenue between Harvard Street and Walnut Street. D' Amico stated that some rooms in the building did not have heat, that there was water infiltration in the foundation, the fieldstone foundation was crumbling, and that the building had mold problems. Lang suggested that the building could be renovated or added onto. D'Amico stated that the cost of renovation was too high and that his family wished to construct a new residence and reside there. Lang stated that there were surviving historic details on the exterior including windows and trimwork. Lang stated that renovation could be a more cost-effective option to constructing a new residence. Morton and Wojciechowski indicated that they felt the building did not warrant preservation due to its current condition and setting. Grissom stated that she believed the building was worth preserving and motioned to find the building preferably preserved, this motion failed due to lack of a second. Morton motioned to find the building not preferably preserved and this motion failed due to lack of a second. Staff stated that since a majority vote of the Commission in favor of instituting the Demolition Delay is required, the building would be effectively found not preferably preserved due to lack of action.

## 51 Plainfield Street - Demolition Review

Armando Petruzziello presented an application to demolish the building. The Commission reviewed the application, historical documentation on the neighborhood, as well as photographs of the property and neighborhood. Staff stated that this 1922 Dutch Colonial residence is located with the Pine Ridge Road and Plainfield Street National Register Historic District and therefore subject to an 18-month demolition delay. The district is listed for its architectural significance as an example of a transitional neighborhood with late 19<sup>th</sup> century architectural styles of Queen Anne and Shingle mixing with Colonial Revival, Craftsman and Tudor styles of the early 20<sup>th</sup> century. The neighborhood is also listed for its association



with the development of the village of Waban as a suburban neighborhood accessible to Boston via the train. The first occupants of this building were Rawson and Mabel Cohen. Rawson was a salesman in Boston. Later the building was owned by Benjamin and Helen Bullman. Benjamin worked as a heating engineer. Shortly after permitting the construction of the building, an attached garage was added to the side and rear of the building. The addition has matching brick and the garage doors face the rear of the property. Aside from the addition, the building appears to have no substantial alterations and retains its shiplap siding, windows, and wood trim. The building is also consistent in scale and style with others in the neighborhood and is listed as a contributing building to the district. Petruzziello stated that the building would be difficult to renovate as it has low ceilings and was not marketable in its current condition. Wojciechowski stated that the building's listing on the National Register was important in reviewing its potential to be placed on a Demolition Delay. Grissom stated that an addition could be added to the rear of the building which could include desirable modern features such as a new kitchen and master bedroom. Wojciechowski motioned to find the building preferably preserved with Morton seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 23, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

**RESOLVED** to find the residence at <u>51 Plainfield Street</u> Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair David Morton, Member
Nancy Grissom, Member Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

### 22 Waverley Avenue - Demolition Review

Sean Leary presented an application to demolish the building. The Commission reviewed the application, historical documentation on the property, as well as photographs of the property and neighborhood. Staff stated that this 1887 Queen Anne residence is located in a neighborhood of other Victorian era residences, including other Queen Anne residences. The adjacent Queen Anne residence at the corner of Waverley Avenue and Washington Street was recently turned 90° to face Waverley Avenue and renovated. This building appears to have been built by Henry F. Ross, a local carpenter and contractor. The first owner Corinne Cleveland was a widow who rented out rooms to boarders and owned the property into the early 20<sup>th</sup>-century. It was later owned by Thomas and Margaret Greer. Thomas worked in the real estate business in Boston. The building has had alterations including replacement siding and windows and the front porch was replaced at some point. The surrounding neighborhood has a strong late 19<sup>th</sup> century architectural context and though this building has had alterations it is consistent in style, scale, and time period with the neighborhood. Leary stated that the building had been substantially altered, had water infiltration issues with a leaky foundation, that the building had had a fire in 1959, and that the window sills and eaves were rotted. Leary also noted that the historical documentation on the property also stated that the building had been altered. Grissom suggested that a new foundation could be constructed to alleviate the water issues. Morton stated that he felt the building did not warrant preservation due to the alterations that have occurred. Grissom motioned to find the building not preferably preserved with Morton seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 23, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 3-1,

**RESOLVED** to find the residence at <u>22 Waverley Avenue</u> Not Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:
Alfred Wojciechowski, Member
David Morton, Member
Nancy Grissom, Member

Voting in the Negative:
Donald Lang, Chair

